



STAFF REPORT

DESIGN REVIEW BOARD

September 19, 2024

ITEM TITLE: TIM P. JONES (APPLICANT); CONSTRUCTION OF ONE NEW THREE-STORY FOUR-PLEX RESIDENTIAL TOWNHOME BUILDING, EACH UNIT IS PROVIDED WITH A TWO-CAR GARAGE AT 745 13TH STREET (APN 627-011-05-00) USE-22-0119 MF 1493

ORIGINATING DEPARTMENT:

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:

The owner of a property at 745 13th Street, which is located in the C/MU-1 (General Commercial & Mixed-Use) zone, has initiated the process to demolish the existing single-family residence and construct one new three-story four-plex residential townhome building, each unit is provided with a two-car garage.

RECOMMENDATION:

That the Design Review Board consider the design of the proposed new three-story four-plex residential townhome building, each unit is provided with a two-car garage at 745 13th Street (APN 627-011-05-00) and recommend approval of the project's design to the City Council.

RATIONALE:

The project should contribute favorably to the mixed-use corridor and would comply with the purpose of the C/MU-1 Zone, which is to provide areas for mixed-use development, multiple-family dwellings, and for businesses to meet the local demand for commercial goods and services. It is intended that the dominant type of commercial activity in the C/MU-1 zone will be community and neighborhood serving retail and office uses. Residential dwelling units may be permitted at a maximum density of one unit per every one thousand gross square feet of lot area, except that exclusively residential developments are required to comply with the development standards of the R-1500 (High Density Residential) Zoning District.

OPTIONS:

In addition to reviewing this report and adopting staff's recommendations, the Design Review Board can:

- Recommend approval of the project with additional conditions provided by the Design Review Board; or
- Recommend that the project not be approved; or
- Recommend revisions based on comments from the Design Review Board.

BACKGROUND/ANALYSIS:

An application (USE-22-0119) was submitted to the City on October 12, 2022, for Site Plan Review (SPR-22-0034) and Design Review Case (DRC-22-0033), proposing to demolish the existing single-family residence and construct one new three-story four-plex residential townhome building, each unit is provided with a two car garage at 745 13th Street (APN 627-011-05-00) in the C/MU-1 (General Commercial and Mixed-Use) Zone.

The project site is an existing 6,997 square foot lot fronting 13th Street. The project would demolish the existing single-family residence and construct one new three-story four-plex residential townhome building, each unit is provided with a two car garage. Vehicular ingress and egress to the property would be provided from the existing alley on the east side of the property.



The surrounding areas (north, south, and west) are zoned C/MU-1 (General Commercial & Mixed Use) zone, which is similar to the subject site and the surrounding uses are commercial and residential in character. The properties to the east are zoned R-3000 (Two-Family Residential) zone and are residential in character.

Building Orientation and Design:

The proposed building orientation provides one new three-story four-plex residential townhome building fronting 13th Street. Vehicular ingress and egress to the property would be provided from the existing alley on the east side of the property. Off-street parking areas are accessed from the existing alley in the form of a two-car garage for each unit. Pedestrian access to the units is provided from 13th Street via a gated concrete walkway on the north west corner of the property.





The building proposes four townhome units, each with a two-car garage. Each unit is 1,485 sq. ft. in size and has three bedrooms per unit. To provide variation in the building footprint and to lend relief for the massing of the building, the project proposes four balconies on the south building elevation, four balconies on the third floor on the north elevation, a five foot setback from the north property line on the first and second floor, and a ten foot setback on the third floor. The height of the building when measured from the average of the existing grade is 30 feet, which is compliant with Imperial Beach Municipal Code (IBMC) Section 19.17.060 Building Height.



Building Materials: The building's architectural style would have a modern design with three different shades of stucco including Cadet Blue, Queen Blue, and Gainsboro. The proposed stucco finished is Medium Sand 1.5. The building accents include Pure White Sherwin Williams Trim, James Hardie Plank Siding in Cadet Blue, Jeld-Wen Steel Exterior Doors in Sherwin Williams Indigo, Jeld-Wen V-2500 windows, Wrought Iron Balcony railing, and Clopay Modern Steel Garage Doors in Gray.

Landscaping: Typically, projects that propose exclusively residential developments in the C/MU-1 (General Commercial and Mixed-Use) Zone are required to comply with the development standards of the R-1500 (High Density Residential) Zoning District. In this zone, not less than fifty percent of the required front yard and street side yard setbacks shall be landscaped and permanently maintained (IBMC Section 19.50.040) and every residential development shall provide a minimum of three hundred square feet of usable open space per dwelling unit (IBMC 19.50.010).

The project proposes 592 sq. ft. (79%) of landscaping in the front yard. Landscaping includes trees, shrubs, and ground covers such as (1) Marina Strawberry Tree, (1) Pygmy Date Palm Multi-Trunk, (6) Queen Palm, (3) Blue Flame Agave, (36) Little Rev Flax Lily, (10) Variegated Flax Lily, (7) Little Sur Coffeeberry, (27) Breeze Mat Rush, and (11) Purple New Zealand Flax.

In regard to open space, the project proposes 916 sq. ft. of open space at grade, and each unit is provided with a 72 square foot private balcony totaling 288 sq. ft. of open space in the form of private balconies. In addition, the development proposes a decorative fence with four foot tall pilasters with a four foot tall wrought iron fence in between on the west property line, a six foot tall wood fence on the north and south property line, and a six foot tall wrought iron fence on the east property line. On the southeast corner of the property, there will be no fence within the required five foot rear yard setback.



PLANT SCHEDULE SITE

SYMBOL	CODE	BOTANICAL NAME	COMMON NAME	SIZE	WUCOLS	QTY	
TREES							
	ARB MRN	Arbutus x 'Marina'	Marina Strawberry Tree Standard	24"box	LOW	1	
	PHO MUL	Phoenix roebelenii	Pygmy Date Palm Multi-Trunk	5 gal	MODERATE	1	
	SYA QU2	Syagrus romanzoffiana	Queen Palm	10' BTH	MODERATE	6	
SHRUBS							
	AGA TAF	Agave attenuata 'Blue Flame'	Blue Flame Agave	5 gal	LOW	3	
	DIA UEY	Dianella revoluta 'Little Rev'	Little Rev Flax Lily	1 gal	LOW	36	
	DIA VAR	Dianella tasmanica 'Variegata'	Variegated Flax Lily	5 gal	MODERATE	10	
	FRA RSR	Frangula californica 'Little Sur'	Little Sur Coffeeberry	5 gal	VERY LOW	7	
	LOM BRE	Lomandra longifolia 'LM300'	Breeze™ Mat Rush	5 gal	LOW	27	
	PHO ATR	Phormium tenax 'Atropurpureum'	Purple New Zealand Flax	5 gal	LOW	11	
SYMBOL	CODE	BOTANICAL NAME	COMMON NAME	CONT	WUCOLS	SPACING	QTY
GROUND COVERS							
	FES FUX	Festuca arundinacea 'West Coaster'	West Coaster Tall Fescue	sod	HIGH		434 sf
	SEN BLU	Senecio mandraliscae 'Blue Chalk Sticks'	Senecio	flat	LOW	8" o.c.	170 sf

Parking: Projects that propose exclusively residential developments in the C/MU-1 (General Commercial and Mixed-Use) Zone are required to comply with the development standards of the R-1500 (High Density Residential) Zoning District. The parking requirement in the R-1500 (High Density Residential) Zoning District is two spaces per dwelling unit, fifty percent enclosed. As such, the project is required to provide a total of eight parking spaces, 50% enclosed. The project is proposing eight parking spaces in the form of a two-car garage per unit, 100% enclosed. The proposed surfacing for the drive aisle is concrete and enhanced pavers.

Design Review Board:

The Design Review Board reviewed the project on April 18, 2024, and recommended design revisions and requested further consideration at a future Design Review Board Meeting with a vote of 4 (AYES) – 0 (NOES) – 1 (DISQUALIFIED) (member Rogers recused himself from participating on the item due to conflict of interest) with the following considerations:

1. Consider a more sturdy material such as CMU Block Wall on the south property line to provide additional safety measures when vehicles are utilizing the drive aisle.

2. Consider a more sturdy material or other material on the south and north property line instead of Yellow Pine Dog Ear Fencing.
3. Consider more shade trees where feasible.
4. Consider a more beach oriented, and modern exterior building design.
5. Consider a redesign for the proposed building exterior elevations.
6. Consider providing a site plan that shows adjacent properties.
7. Consider providing a demolition plan.
8. Consider providing additional vertical privacy screening on the south property line.
9. Consider incorporating the RCP Block with building colors, such as the stucco and stone to provide a more cohesive project design.
10. Consider sealing the Yellow Pine Dog Ear fencing as unfinished and pressured treated material warps over time.
11. Consider carrying the El Dorado Stone across the first floor exterior elevations to the corner of the building.
12. Consider providing exterior building contrast above the first floor such as siding, cement material, or material with vertical or horizontal patterns.
13. Consider terracotta roof tile instead of roof shingles.
14. Consider achieving the 10' step back in a more modern and contemporary manner.
15. Consider incorporating the exterior style of the previously reviewed project (Hilton Hotel) to create a more current, light color, beach oriented design.
16. Consider adding vertical screening trees in the planters instead of low level plants on the south property line.
17. Consider proposing a 3' CMU block and 3' fence (or other material) on the south property line to improve vehicle back up safety.
18. Consider more vertical screening in addition to the Mediterranean Fan Palm and Phoenix Thornless Mesquite.
19. Consider providing additional lighting on the east elevation (alley) to improve safety for future residents.
20. Consider reducing the height of the fence on the alley or setback from the property line to improve line of sight for pedestrians and vehicles.
21. Consider more textures and colors on the exterior building elevations to be more beach oriented.
22. Consider providing the Design Review Board with a couple of elevations that have different exterior design and finishes.

Most of the recommendations have been addressed and incorporated into the project/plans. Regarding the comment, "Consider a more sturdy material such as CMU Block Wall on the south property line to provide additional safety measures when vehicles are utilizing the drive aisle", the applicant stated that changing the fence material would be cost prohibitive.

Additionally, regarding the comment, "Consider providing a site plan that shows adjacent properties", the applicant stated that adjacent properties are reflected on the 3D rendering sheets.

Regarding the comment, "Consider terracotta roof tile instead of roof shingles" and "Consider proposing a 3' CMU block and 3' fence (or other material) on the south property line to improve vehicle back up safety", the applicant stated that changing the material would be cost prohibitive.

Further responses to the Design Review Board Recommendations can be found in Attachment 6 of this staff report.

General Plan Consistency:

The project is located in the C/MU-1 (General Commercial & Mixed Use) Zone. The purpose of the C/MU-1 Zone is to provide areas for mixed-use development, multiple-family dwellings, and for businesses to meet the local demand for commercial goods and services. It is intended that the dominant type of commercial activity in the C/MU-1 zone will be community and neighborhood

servicing retail and office uses. Residential dwelling units may be permitted at a maximum density of one unit per every one thousand gross square feet of lot area, except that exclusively residential developments are required to comply with the development standards of the R-1500 (High Density Residential) Zoning District. The proposed residential development meets the purpose and intent of the land use designation.

Zoning Chart:

R-1500 Zoning Standards	Provided/Proposed
<p>Yard requirements for the R-1500 zone are as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> A. Front Yard. There shall be a minimum front yard of fifteen feet, provided that the front of a garage shall be set back a minimum of twenty feet. B. Side Yard. There shall be a minimum side yard on each side of five feet for the first two floors of any structure. Above the second floor, an additional five feet of setback shall be provided on each side. C. Rear Yard. There shall be a minimum rear yard of five feet if on an alley and ten feet if no alley. D. Street Side Yard. There shall be a minimum street side yard of ten feet. E. Additional yard requirements in relation to single family homes. In considering site plan review or design review for projects adjacent to a single family house, consideration shall be given to increased yard set-backs for upper floors in order to preserve the values of the single family home. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A. The project fronts 13th Street. The residential development provides a fifteen feet front yard setback and the garage is setback 28 feet from the front property line. B. The side yard of the project abuts a commercial use to the north and a residential property to the south. The project proposes a five foot side yard setback from the north property line on the first and second floor, and a ten foot setback on the third floor. C. The rear yard of the project abuts a residential property. The project is maintaining the minimum five foot rear yard setback. D. The property does not have a street side yard. E. The proposed development is adjacent to an existing commercial building to the north, and an existing single-family residence to the south. Additional consideration for the single-family residence was included in the site design as the project provides a 21-foot setback from the south property line.
<p>19.17.040: The minimum lot size for any new lot created in the R-1500 zone shall be three thousand square feet (for related provisions concerning small lots, see Chapter 19.42.).</p>	<p>The project does not propose the creation of a new lot.</p>

<p>19.17.050: Every new lot created in an R-1500 zone shall have a minimum width along a street of fifty feet (for related provisions concerning small lots, see Chapter 19.42.).</p>	<p>The project does not propose the creation of a new lot.</p>
<p>19.17.060: No principal building or structure shall exceed three stories or thirty feet in height, whichever is less. No accessory building or structure shall exceed fifteen feet in height. For exceptions to these height limits see Chapter 19.40.</p>	<p>The height of the building when measured from the average of the existing grade is 29.65 feet, which is compliant with Imperial Beach Municipal Code (IBMC) Section 19.17.060 Building Height.</p>
<p>19.17.070: No buildings shall be located less than ten feet from any other building on the same lot.</p>	<p>The project is proposing only one new three-story four-plex residential townhome building. The project does not propose any additional buildings.</p>
<p>19.17.080: Useable open space and landscaping are as follows (Section 19.50, Minimum useable open space for dwelling units and Residential landscaping):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> A. Every residential development shall provide a minimum of three hundred square feet of usable open space per dwelling unit. "Usable open space" means an unobstructed portion of a lot which has a minimum dimension of ten feet in every direction, is landscaped and developed for active or passive recreational and leisure use, and is conveniently located and accessible. Open space intended to serve all the units of a project shall be accessible and convenient to all units. Private open space shall be accessible and convenient to the unit(s) intended to be served. B. In addition, the following spaces shall contribute to required usable open space areas: Private balconies, provided that the minimum size of the balcony is six feet by ten feet; C. A minimum of sixty percent of the required usable open space shall be provided at grade, unenclosed. D. Not less than fifty percent of the required front yard and street side yard setbacks shall be landscaped and permanently maintained. The remainder of the required yard may be used for driveways and walkways. E. Landscaping shall be provided within the parking area or immediately abutting it. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A. The residential development provides 1,204 sq. ft. of open space. There is 916 sq. ft. of open space at grade and 288 sq. ft. of open space in the form of four balconies. B. The residential development provides four balconies, one per unit, on the south elevation (7' x 10'-3"). C. The residential development proposes 916 sq. ft. of open space at grade. D. The residential development proposes 592 sq. ft. (79%) of landscaping in the front yard. E. The drive aisle that is adjacent to the parking area includes landscaping such as Queen Palms, Breeze Mat Rush, and Purple New Zealand Flax on

<p>F. There shall be a minimum four-foot landscaped area between the structure and any parking located in front of the structure.</p> <p>G. There shall be a minimum three-foot-wide landscaped area between the parking area and each side lot line when parking is located between the structure and the street.</p> <p>H. Prior to issuance of any building permit, a complete landscaping plan shall be submitted to the Community Development Department for approval. Such approval shall be subject to appeal in the manner set forth in Sections 19.84.070 through 19.84.090.</p> <p>I. Landscaping and required watering system shall be installed prior to the use of the premises. All landscaping material in required landscaping areas shall be permanently maintained in a growing and healthy condition, including trimming, as appropriate to the landscaping material.</p> <p>J. A permanent irrigation system shall be installed to serve all landscaped areas.</p>	<p>the south property line. Also, various trees, shrubs, and ground cover are located west of the parking area.</p> <p>F. The development does not provide parking in front of the structure.</p> <p>G. Parking is not proposed between the structure and the street.</p> <p>H. A complete landscape plan would be required prior to issuance of building permits.</p> <p>I. Landscaping and required watering systems shall be installed prior to the use of the premises subject to state requirements.</p> <p>J. A permanent irrigation system shall be installed to serve all landscaped areas subject to state requirements.</p>
<p>19.17.090: The maximum allowable density in the R-1500 zone shall be one dwelling unit for each one thousand five hundred square feet of lot area, not to exceed a maximum density of twenty-nine dwelling units per net acre except as provided for in Section 19.11.095. For lot combining restrictions, see Section 19.42.070.</p>	<p>The lot size for the property is 6,997 sq. ft. (49.97' x 140.04'). The lot size is sufficient for the creation of four units.</p>
<p>19.48.030: The number of required off-street parking spaces for residential uses shall be as follows: R-2000 and R-1500: two spaces per dwelling unit, fifty percent enclosed.</p>	<p>The development is proposing four new units, and as such, eight parking spaces is required, 50% enclosed. The project is proposing eight parking spaces in the form of a two-car garage per unit, 100% enclosed.</p>
<p>19.17.120: At least one distinct ground level, street facing pedestrian entryway shall be provided to a residential dwelling unit for each fifty feet of linear street frontage and a minimum of twenty percent of the first floor of that portion of a residential structure facing a front or side street shall consist of clear glass windows allowing visibility into the dwelling unit.</p>	<p>One pedestrian entryway is provided on the west elevation facing 13th Street. The project requires 18 sq. ft. of window glazing fronting 13th Street. The project is proposing 40 sq. ft. of window glazing to comply with this requirement.</p>
<p>19.17.125: The maximum allowable floor area ratio shall be one hundred percent and the maximum lot</p>	<p>The development proposes a floor area ratio of 85% (1,485 sq. ft. per unit</p>

<p>coverage shall be fifty percent. Garages or covered parking areas shall be excluded from the floor area ratio requirements.</p>	<p>x 4 = 5,940 sq. ft. = 5,940 sq. ft. /6,997 sq. ft. lot size = 0.85 x 100%).</p> <p>The development proposes a lot coverage of 47% (3,254 sq. ft. / 6,997 sq. ft. = .47 x 100%).</p> <p>As such, the development is compliant with the floor area ratio and lot coverage requirements of the R-1500 Zoning District.</p>
<p>19.17.130: Parking areas shall meet the following standard:</p> <p>A. Where properties abut both an alley and a street designed as a collector, major or prime arterial, no new street curb cuts or parking layouts requiring backing into the street shall be allowed.</p>	<p>A. Vehicular ingress and egress to the property would be provided from the existing alley on the east side of the property. Off-street parking areas are accessed from the existing alley in the form of a two-car garage for each unit.</p>

Surrounding Land Use and Zoning:

Surrounding Areas	Surrounding Zoning	Surrounding Land Use
North	C/MU-1 (General Commercial & Mixed-Use)	Commercial
South	C/MU-1 (General Commercial & Mixed-Use)	Residential
East	R-3000 (Two-Family Residential)	Residential
West	C/MU-1 (General Commercial & Mixed-Use)	Commercial

ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT:

This project may be categorically exempt pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15332 Class 32 (In-fill Development Projects).

COASTAL JURISDICTION:

This project is not located in the coastal zone as defined by the California Coastal Act of 1976.

ATTACHMENTS:

1. ATT 1 – Project Plans
2. ATT 2 – Project Renderings
3. ATT 3 – Exterior Building Materials Board
4. ATT 4 – Landscape Plan and Materials Board
5. ATT 5 – Design Review Compliance Check list
6. ATT 6 – Response to DRB Recommendations

7. ATT 7 – April 18, 2024 DRB Recommendations